

THE COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN STUDENT TEAMS ACHIEVEMENT DIVISION (STAD) AND COOPERATIVE INTEGRATED READING AND COMPOSITION (CIRC) METHODS OF STUDENTS' READING ABILITY ON NARRATIVE TEXT

Mahrani

Mahraniwrw89@gmail.com

Dosen Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Universitas Graha Nusantara Padangsidimpuan

ABSTRAK

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui apakah hasil kemampuan membaca teks naratif dengan menggunakan metode Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) memberikan hasil yang lebih baik daripada metode Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) pada siswa kelas VIII SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan pada Tahun Ajaran 2011/2012. Penulis menggunakan metode eksperimen. Populasi penelitian ini adalah siswa kelas VIII SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan, yang terdiri dari 323 siswa. Dua kelas, yaitu VIII-G dan VIII-I diambil sebagai dua kelompok sampel dengan cluster sampling. Jumlah keseluruhan sampel adalah 64 siswa. Data dikumpulkan dengan menggunakan 20 item tes sebagai instrumen. Penulis menggunakan proses statistik dalam menganalisis data, yaitu analisis deskriptif dengan menggunakan rumus "t-test". Setelah menghitung data, ditemukan bahwa hasil kemampuan membaca pada teks naratif yang diajarkan dengan menggunakan metode STAD dikategorikan "baik". Sedangkan kemampuan membaca siswa pada teks naratif yang diajarkan dengan menggunakan metode CIRC dikategorikan "cukup". Hasil dari data yang dianalisis menunjukkan bahwa $2,00 < 3,33 > 2,56$ atau t_o lebih besar dari t_t . Jadi, hipotesis penelitian ini diterima. Artinya, kemampuan membaca siswa pada teks naratif yang diajarkan dengan menggunakan metode Student Achievement Division (STAD) lebih tinggi daripada dengan menggunakan metode Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) pada Siswa Kelas VIII di SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan.

Kata Kunci : kemampuan membaca, teks naratif, STAD, CIRC

ABSTRACT

The aim of this research is to know whether the result of reading ability on narrative text by using Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method gives a better result than Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method at the eighth grade students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan in 2011/2012 Academic Year. The writer uses an experimental method. The population is the eighth grade students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan, which are consisted of 323 students. Two classes, they are VIII-G and VIII-I are taken as two groups of sample by cluster sampling. The whole amount samples is 64 students. The data are collected by using 20 items test as an instrument. The writer uses statistic processes in analyzing data. They are descriptive analysis by using the formula of "t-test". After calculating the data, it is found that the result of reading ability on narrative text taught by using STAD method is categorized "good". While the students' reading ability on narrative text taught by using CIRC method is categorized "enough". The result of the analyzed data shows that $2,00 < 3,33 > 2,56$ or t_o is greater than t_t , so, the hypothesis is accepted. It means, The Student's Reading Ability on Narrative that Taught By Using Students Teams

Achievement Division (STAD) Method is Higher Than Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Method of the Eighth Grade Students at SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan.

Keywords : Reading Ability, Narrative text, STAD, CIRC

I. INTRODUCTION

English is an international language in the world that is taught in Indonesia as a foreign language. English is important for students to follow the development of science and technology in the world to face globalization. The students are expected can master the materials based on the curriculum. In teaching English there are four skills that will be achieved by students, they are listening, speaking, reading and writing. These skills must be mastered by the students.

Reading is one of language skills to be owned by every student in order to be able to comprehend the information from the text material. Now, most of materials of English in junior high school are based on the text or by using genre. Such as narrative, descriptive, procedure, recount and so on.

Narrative text is one of kind of text that should be learned by students of eighth grade in junior high school as curriculum's expectations that the students are able to understanding the kinds of genre especially reading narrative text. Narrative text is a text which tells the story of acts or events, in other word, narrative tell what happened. Narrative text has social function to amuse, entertain, and to deal with actual or various experience in different ways.

This text is very important to study because it is one of the curriculum's expectations in which they are expected to be able to read story exactly in their life. Students can identificate about the generic structure of narrative text such as orientation, complication, resolution, re-orientation and coda. Because reading is useful for language acquisition provided that students more or less understand what they read.

But, if the writer sees in reality, the reading ability of most students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan not all students are

successful in understanding narrative text. They find difficulties in reading based on genre especially narrative text. The writer founds that the score of students are mostly 65 meanwhile the standard score is 75 (2012: 2). They think that reading is considered very difficult skill because it is need for deep comprehension.

Actually, teacher has done some efforts to solve this problem. Such as, motivate students, give English course in the afternoon, giving various simple texts and giving more reading exercises. But, there is no significant progress in students' learning result.

If this problem is not solved, it is will make students in bad condition. Because reading narrative is one of curriculum's expectation. In this case, teacher has important role in improving students' reading ability. There are many methods that can be used in teaching reading, such as The STAD Method, The CIRC Methods, The Grammar Translation Method, The Direct Method, The Drill Method, The Audio Lingual Method, The Silent Way Method, The TPR Method, Community Language Learning, etc. These methods give guidance in reading process, of course give better result on students' reading ability on narrative text.

II. THE THEORITICAL FRAMEWORKS

Reading Narrative Text

Reading is an activity to get information from a the text such as narrative text. M. F Patel and Praveen M. Jain (2008:113) stated that reading is an active process which consist of recognition and comprehension skill.

There are three indicators of reading narrative text. Tey are: a) Social function of narrative text is a text which tell the story

which has the social function to amuse, entertain the reader. Sanggam Siahaan and Kisno (2008:74) said that narration is any written English text in which the writer wants to amuse, entertain people, and to deal with actual or various experiences in different ways, b) generic structure of narrative text written with some components of generic structure. Otong Setiawan Djuharie (2007:41) said that the generic structure of narrative text are: Orientation, beginning or introduction, introduces main characters, setting and time. The opening paragraph introduces characters / participants of the story and sets the scene (it answers the questions who, when, what and where. Complication, middle, the problem happens among the characters. It is about the problems which involve the main character in the story developed. Resolution, ending the problem is dissolved. It is about how the problems in the story are solved (better or worse). Here, the main characters find ways to solve the problems. Re-orientation/Coda, is summary contains the conclusions with the intent to deliver a moral message to the readers, c) the language (grammatical) features on narrative text are the language features that used in writing narrative. Sanggam Siahaan stated (2008:74) that dominant grammatical aspects of narrative text are: 1) focus on specific and usually individualized participants, 2) use of material process, 3) use of relational process and mental process, 4) use of temporal conjunction, and temporal circumstances, 5) use of past tense.

Based on the experts' opinion above, the writer concludes that the social function of narrative text is to amuse or entertain the reader with various past story or events. The generic structures of narrative text are: orientation, complication, resolution and re-orientation / code. Then, the dominant grammatical features in narrative text are relational and mental process, temporal conjunction, temporal circumstance and past tense.

Based on the explanation above, the writer concludes that reading narrative text is

an active process to understand the main idea or experiences of the author on that text which is consist of social function, generic structure and lexicogrammatical features.

Comparative Methods

Teaching method is a way that teacher's use to transfer knowledge to the students in teaching and learning process with some steps and designs based on the material and condition in the class room itself. It is one of important factors to improve the quality of teaching learning process

Hamzah B. Uno (2012:2) said that teaching method is define as way that teachers' use, in which doing his function as a tool to reach the purpose of learning.

From the explanation, writer concludes that teaching method is a way to transfer knowledge or information to the students that have important role in improving students' reading ability. Therefore teacher must be able to choose effective teaching methods to improve students' reading ability on narrative text.

Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method is a kind of cooperative learning that use in teams form while teaching and learning process. It is the simple method and students study the material with their team. Sri Anitah (2008:10) said that Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) is a very simple cooperative learning method. The teacher uses the STAD method, toward in grouping.

There are some steps to apply the STAD method in teaching an learning process. As one of cooperative learning. Rusman (2011:21) said that there are some steps in teaching STAD method. They are: 1) Convey the purposes and motivations. Convey the purpose of the material that will be reach in that learning and motivate the students to study, 2) Team divisions. Divide the students into some teams which consist of 4-5 members in each team heterogeneous, 3) Teacher presentation. Teacher convey the material and the purpose of the lesson before. In the learning process, teacher helps with media, demonstration, and question, 4) Team works.

Student work in their teams. Teacher gives the work paper as a direction for team works. During the teams work, teacher monitoring, guidance and supporting and helping if it is needed, 5) Quiz (Evaluations) . Teacher evaluates the learning result by giving test or quiz about the material that studied and also giving score to result of each presentation from the teams. The students sit individually and no permit to do it with their teams, 6) Team Recognitions. After doing a quiz, the teacher looks for the work result of the students and gives the score from 0-100. Then, gives the rewards to the success team.

Based on the experts' explanation above, the writer concludes that the steps of STAD method should be inform the purpose and motivates, teacher presents the material, team work activity, doing evaluation, and team recognition to get the rewards in the end of learning.

Based on the explanation above, the writer concludes that Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method is a simple cooperative learning method that apply in grouping which has some steps. Such as teacher informs the purpose and motivate students, teacher presents the material, students work in team, evaluation, and the last team recognition and rewards.

Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method is one of cooperative learning method which is design in group to help students in reading and writing skill of some materials. Stevens, in Miftahul Huda said (2006:28) said that CIRC method is design to accommodate the varieties of students' competence, through heterogeneous grouping or homogeneous grouping. There are some steps to design a cooperative learning such as CIRC method. Slavin in Suyitno (2005:4) stated that there are 8 elements in CIRC method, they are :a) Teams, is make heterogeneous grouping that consist of 4 or 5 students, 2) Placement test, is the average score from their daily test score or based on their report score so that the teacher know the advantage and disadvantage of students, 3) Student creative, doing a task in a group which create the situation where the

success of individual is based or influenced by their group success, 4) Team study, is the learning step that should be done by the group and teacher give a helping to the group, 5) Team scorer and team recognition, is the step to give the score to the result of group and recognition to the success group, 6) Teaching group, give the material as soon as from the teacher before doing a group task, 7) Fact test, the test based on the fact that students achieve, 8) Whole-class unit, teacher give the conclusion.

Based on the experts' opinion above, the writer concludes that the steps of CIRC method are: 1) make heterogeneous group, 2) placement test, 3) student creative, 4) team study, 5) team scorer and recognition, 6) teaching group, 7) fact test, 8) give conclusion.

Based on the whole explanation above, the writer concludes that Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method is a cooperative learning method which design to develop language skills such as reading and writing by divided students into some small heterogeneous or homogeneous grouping.

III. METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH

The writer conducted this research at SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan. Its location is on Jalan Sutan Soripada Mulia No.42 Padangsidempuan. The teaching learning process at this school is very active. The research is conducted about three months from September to November 2012.

The method of this research is experimental method because to find out the cause-effect relationship between two factors from the event. Alison Mackey (2005:7) stated that experimental method is a method which manipulate one or more variables (independent variables) to determine the effect on another variable (dependent variable).

Population is all subjects that are observed. Arikunto (2006:130) stated that

population is all of the subjects of the research. The population of this research is all grades of VIII students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan which consist of 323 students. Sample is a part of population. Anas Sudjono (2008:280) stated that sample is a small group proportion of population which should be research, chosen or determined for the analysis need. The sample of this research is 64 students from two classes, VIII-G and VIII-I that taken by using cluster sampling. Sudjana (2001:92) noted that cluster sampling is used when the population is big enough and only a part of population which is researched.

Instrument is a tool to test or measure the correlation of two or more variables. Leslie ((2011:58) said that instrument is the measurement tools and an integral component of any research study. William (2011: 124) said that test is a measurement of an instrument that is arranged specifically to measure something certain and important. The writer uses the test as the instrument is to measure the students' reading ability on narrative on text by applied to the Student Teams Achievement (STAD) as an experimental group in VIII-G class and Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) methods as a control group in VIII-I class and the result of the test will be used as the data of this research.

The writer uses statistics formula to analyze the data. There are two kinds to analyze the data in research, they are: descriptive analysis and inferential analysis. Descriptive analysis is used to describe the variables, for instance: mean, median, modus, histogram and so forth. While, inferential analysis uses of analysis the hypothesis in the research by using t-test formula.

IV. THE RESEARCH RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

After collecting the data from students' reading ability on narrative text by using Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) Method, it is found the highest score is 80 and the lowest score is 50. From the

calculation, it is known that the mean of STAD method at the eighth grade of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan is 70. The median is 73, and the mode is 74.

The distribution of frequency of reading ability on narrative text by using STAD method shows that the 4 students who get score 80-85 is or 12,5%, 8 students who get 75-79 or 25%, 12 students who get 70-74 or 37,5%, 3 students who get 65-69 or 9,375%, 2 students who get 60-64 or 6,25%, 2 students who get 55-59 or 6,25%, and 1 student who get 50-54 or 3,125%. Based on the distribution of data above, the writer found that most of students got score about 70-74. There are 12 students or 37,5% got it.

The students' achievement in each indicator by using STAD method is the students' ability in identifying social function in the narrative text as the first indicator, it is in the question number 1 and 14, the students get score 215 and the mean is 6,6. It is categorized "enough". The students' ability in identifying generic structure in the narrative text as the second indicator. It is question number 2,3,4,7,11,12,15,17,18, and 20, the students get score 1170 and the mean is 7,29. It is categorized "good". The students' ability in identifying lexicogrammatical features in the narrative text as the third indicator. It is question number 5,6,8,9,10,13,16, and 20, the students get score 844 and the mean is 6,6. It is categorized "enough".

After collecting the data of reading ability on narrative text by using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method, it is found that the highest score is 80 and the lowest score is 50. From the calculation, it is known that the mean is 63. The median is 70 and the mode is 67.

The distribution frequency of reading ability on narrative text by using CIRC method, that the 2 students who get score 80-85 is or 6,25%, 5 students who get 75-79 or 15,625%, 5 students who get 70-75 or 15,625%, 8 students who get 65-69 or 25%, 7 students who get 60-64 or 21,875% and 3 students who get 55-59 or 9,375% and 2 students who get 50-59 or 6,25%. Based on

the distribution of data above, the writer found that most of students got score about 65-69. There are 8 students or 25% got it.

The students' achievement of reading ability on narrative text by using CIRC method in each indicator is The students' ability in identifying social function in the narrative text as the first indicator, it is in the question number 1 and 14, the students get score 180 and the mean is 5,5 . It is categorized "bad". The students' ability in identifying generic structure in the narrative text as the second indicator. It is question number 2,3,4,7,11,12,15,17,18,dan 19, the students get score 1105 and the mean is 6,9. It is categorized "enough". The students' ability in identifying lexicogrammatical features in the narrative text as the third indicator. It is question number 5,6,8,9,10,13,16,and 20,the students get score 798 and the mean is 6,2. It is categorized "enough".

The data which is taken will answer the hypothesis that the writer has explained previously. The data is analyzed by using "t-test". The result of data analysis by using "t-test" shows the score of t_o is 3.33 when it compared with the t_t (t-table) at the level of 5% significant level is 2.00 and the level of 1 % significant level is 2.65 with degrees of freedom (df) = $N_1 + N_2 - 2 = 32 + 32 - 2 = 62$ because there is no $df = 62$ in the "t-test" table, the writer takes the nearer df , it is $df = 60$, so, the score of "t-test" table in the 5% level of significant is 2.00, and in 1% level of significant is 2.65.

From the result data anlysis by using t_{test} formula shows the score of t_{test} is 3.33 and t_{table} is known 2.00 and 2.65 it means, the score of t observed or t_o is greater than the score in the "t-test" table, where $2,00 < 3,33 > 2,65$.

Based on the research findings, the writer found that the treatments of Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method give better result than the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method that teacher used. It can be seen from the score of students' achievement. And also by applying

this method, students are easier to read narrative text. As the writer has explained that Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method is one of cooperative learning method that apply in grouping which use heterogeneous grouping.

In reading narrative text, the writer treats Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) and Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) methods to the experimental method. Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method gives the better result than Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method. Because STAD method is more suitable to be applied in reading narrative text. STAD helps students to understanding the text especially narrative text which design the learning process into some groups, so the students can help their friend in reading and understanding the text. The process of reading is more easy and it is improve the students' responsibility in learning process. It shows that STAD guide students to understand the structures in reading narrative clearly.

By doing the research, it is found that the using of suitable method is very important in teaching and learning process. Teaching method has important role in determining the success of learning process. Because teaching method helps teacher to deliver the knowledge to the students. So, the students can catch and understand the subject and to develop their skill well.

The application of STAD method gives better result of students' achievement in reading ability on narrative text. In teaching reading, teacher must be able to use suitable method. Because students are expected to have the reading ability in order to make them can get main ideas of what their reading in their own lives. Giving guidance when students are reading, it will make them enjoy their reading and they also easy to understand the content of what they read, and then the teacher gives motivate to the students to do much exercises in reading to improve their skill in helping them to read well. Finally, students' reading ability become well.

V. THE CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

The Conclusion

Student 's reading ability on narrative text that taught by using Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method at the eighth grade students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan 2011/2012 Academic Year is categorized "good". And students' reading ability on narrative text that taught by using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method is categorized "enough". It shows that students' reading ability on narrative text that taught by using Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method is better than Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method at the eighth grade students of SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan in 2011/2012 Academic Year. It means the hypothesis is accepted.

Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) is a cooperative learning method which is design in small groups learning . By applying this method, students are easier to understand the social function, generic structures and lexicogrammatical features of narrative text because the method is in grouping form which the students can read and discuss the narrative text with their friend. On the other hand, it helps teacher in solving problem which is faced by students in reading narrative text such as students are difficult to understand the main idea of narrative text. so, the application of Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD) method gives the positive contribution to the teachers in teaching reading narrative text. Furthermore, for the students which study English are be able to read narrative text well based on the curriculum expectation.

The Suggestion

To the English teachers must use the appropriate or suitable teaching method in teaching and learning process to improve and develop students' skill especially in reading

ability such as Student Teams Achievement Division (STAD). The students are hoped to be more active in learning English, especially study about narrative text. In addition, to another researcher to increase the reading ability of narrative text and take another variables that has influence to the result of reading narrative text

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Anita, Sri, Strategi Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris, Jakarta: Universitas Terbuka, 2008.
- Arikunto, Suharsimi, Prosedur penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik, Jakarta: Rhineka Cipta, 2002.
- Huda Miftahul, The Cooperative Learning, Bandung: Universitas Terbuka, 2006.
- Mackey Alison and Susan M. Grass, Second Language Research Metology and Design, London: Laurence Erlbaum Associates, 2005.
- Nana Sudjana, Penelitian dan Penilaian Pendidikan, Bandung: Seminar Baru Algesindo, 2001.
- Patel, M.F. and Praveen M. Jain ,English language Teaching (methods, tools & techniques), India : Sunrise Publisher & Distributors , 2008
- Rusman, Model-Model Pembelajaran Mengembangkan Profesionalismew Guru, Jakarta: Rajawali Pers, 2011.
- Siahaan, Sanggam and Kisno Shinoba, Generic Text Structure, Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu, 2008.
- SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan, Daftar Kumpulan Nilai (DKN), Padangsidempuan: SMP Negeri 4 Padangsidempuan, Tahun Ajaran 2011/2012.
- Suyitno Amin, Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif, Jakarta: Nusa Media, 2005.
- Uno, Hamzah, Model Pembelajaran, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2011.
- William M.K. Trochim, T_Test, (<http://www.socialresearchmethods.net/kb/Assets/mag el/banner .jpg>) retrieved on 25th January 2011.